CS 4910: Intro to Computer Security

Ethical Decision-Making in Cybersecurity

Instructor: Xi Tan

Connecting the dots...

Ethics

Ethics are the principles you hold that guide your behavior and decisions.

- Strong ethics help make good decisions in new situations.
- An ethical situation occurs when a decision's outcome may cause harm to someone or something.
 - An ethical dilemma is when no decision is harmless.

Cybersecurity

Cybersecurity is the field of practice that protects computer system data, information, and functionality from harm.

- A harm is a negative consequence to an asset: information/resource with value.
- An attack is the act of causing harm by exploiting a vulnerability.
- A vulnerability is an aspect of a system that can cause it to behave incorrectly.

Connecting the dots... Ethics and Cybersecurity are Strongly Related

Ethics

Ethics are the principles you hold that guide your behavior and decisions.

Cybersecurity

Cybersecurity is the field of practice that protects computer system data, information, and functionality from harm.

Attacks create ethical situations by causing harm

- An ethical situation occurs when a decision's outcome may cause harm to someone or something.
 - An ethical dilemma is when no decision is harmless.

- An attack is the act of causing harm by exploiting a vulnerability.
- A vulnerability is an aspect of a system that can cause it to behave incorrectly.

Vulnerabilities also Cause an Ethical Situation

Suppose Penny discovers a vulnerability in a software product used in many computer systems.

Penny has an obligation not to exploit that vulnerability

Could face legal consequences

Penny also has a decision whether or not to disclose that vulnerability

Could tell the software product vendor

Could tell the world

Could tell nobody

Could tell the software product vendor

Private Disclosure

The vendor may fix it, and thereby prevent harm from coming.

The vendor may do nothing about it, and thereby allow harm to come.

Could tell the software product vendor—

Private Disclosure

The vendor may fix it, and thereby prevent harm from coming.

The vendor may do nothing about it, and thereby allow harm to come.

Could tell the world

Public/Full Disclosure

Raise awareness of it; may encourage the vendor/others to fix it and prevent harm.

Facilitates adversaries to exploit it and allow harm.

Could tell the software product vendor—

Private Disclosure

The vendor may fix it, and thereby prevent harm from coming.

The vendor may do nothing about it, and thereby allow harm to come.

Could tell the world

Public/Full Disclosure

Raise awareness of it; may encourage the vendor/others to fix it and prevent harm.

Facilitates adversaries to exploit it and allow harm.

Could tell nobody_

Non-Disclosure

If no one knows about it, no one can exploit it, so may avoid harm.

Adversaries may already know it or find it independently, so may allow harm.

Could tell the software product vendor

Private Disclosure

The vendor may fix it, and thereby prevent harm from coming.

The vendor may do nothing about it, and thereby allow harm to come.

Could tell the world

Public/Full Disclosure

Vulnerability disclosure is an ethical dilemma

Could tell nobody.

Non-Disclosure

If no one knows about it, no one can exploit it, so may avoid harm.

Adversaries may already know it or find it independently, so may allow harm.

Stacking up disclosure models with DFEI principles

Disclosure Model	Private	Public	Non	
Integrity	Act with honesty in all situations			
Trust	Build trust in all stakeholder relationships			
Accountability	Accept responsibility for all decisions			
Transparency	Maintain open and truthful communications			
Fairness	Engage in fair competition and create equitable and just relationships			
Respect	Honor the rights, freedoms, views, and property of others			
Rule of Law	Comply with the spirit and intent of laws and regulations			
Viability	Create long-term value for all relevant stakeholders			

Stacking up disclosure models with DFEI principles

Disclosure Model	Private	Public	Non
Integrity	✓	✓	×
Trust	×	×	×
Accountability	×	✓	×
Transparency	5	\checkmark	×
Fairness	×	✓	×
Respect	✓	×	?
Rule of Law	✓	?	\checkmark
Viability	✓	\checkmark	×

Responsible (Coordinated) Disclosure

Model for cybersecurity researchers (aka ethical hackers*) to engage with vendors:

- 1. Independent researcher discovers a vulnerability
- 2. The **researcher privately discloses** the vulnerability to the vendor, with a timeline Allows vendor time to address a security vulnerability

 Often between 3-6 months from date of disclosure
- 3. If not fixed in time, the researcher publicly discloses the vulnerability.

Premise is to hold vendors accountable for security problems.

Responsible Disclosure Can Go Badly (Case)



9 Mar.

Mallory discovers a bug that reveals shopping cart contents and shipping (not billing) info

- Sends detailed report to the vendor
- Gets an ack and a case manager POC

What Went Wrong? Is anyone at fault?

Loss of transparency



9 Mar.

Mallory discovers a bug that reveals shopping cart contents and shipping (not billing) info

- Sends detailed report to the vendor
- Gets an ack and a case manager POC

4 May

The vulnerability still exists, so Mallory asks for an update.

• A different case manager responds that he is requesting an update from product team.



10 June

Mallory publishes a blog post explaining the vulnerability.

The case manager reaches out to confirm the bug.

10 Apr.

So far, so good

Mallory requests an update. The case manager says the bug has been deemed not severe enough to fix urgently and was closed by the product team.

7 June

Lack of trust?

Mallory finds out cyber-criminals are exploiting the vulnerability to harvest and sell customer data.

24 June

Lack of accountability?

How fares Responsible (Coordinated) Disclosure?

Disclosure Model	Private	Public	Non	Responsible
Integrity	✓	✓	×	
Trust	×	×	×	
Accountability	×	✓	×	
Transparency	?	✓	×	
Fairness	×	✓	×	
Respect	✓	×	?	
Rule of Law	✓	?	✓	
Viability	\checkmark	\checkmark	×	

How fares Responsible (Coordinated) Disclosure?

Disclosure Model	Private	Public	Non	Responsible
Integrity	✓	✓	×	\checkmark
Trust	×	×	×	\checkmark
Accountability	×	✓	×	\checkmark
Transparency	Ş	✓	×	\checkmark
Fairness	×	✓	×	\checkmark
Respect	✓	×	?	\checkmark
Rule of Law	✓	?	✓	?
Viability	✓	✓	×	✓

Learn More

Daniels Fund Ethics Initiative

https://www.danielsfund.org/ethics/overview

https://business.uccs.edu/resources/ethics

Disclosure

https://iamthecavalry.org/about/disclosure/

https://googleprojectzero.blogspot.com/

DANIELS FUND ETHICS INITIATIVE

PRINCIPLES

Integrity

Act with honesty in all situations

Trust

Build trust in all stakeholder relationships

Accountability
Accept responsibility for all decisions

Transparency
Maintain open and truthful communications

Fairness

Engage in fair competition and create equitable and just relationships

Respect

Honor the rights, freedoms, views, and property of others

Rule of Law

Comply with the spirit and intent of laws and regulations